

1 THE HONORABLE JOHN C. COUGHENOUR
2
3
4
5
6

7 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
8 WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON
9 AT SEATTLE

10 EYE ASSOCIATES NORTHWEST P.C.,

11 Plaintiff,

12 CASE NO. C18-1312-JCC

13 v.

14 ORDER

15 SENTINEL INSURANCE COMPANY,
16 LIMITED, part of the HARTFORD FIRE &
17 CASUALTY GROUP,

18 Defendant.

19 Pursuant to the parties' stipulation and proposed order (Dkt. No. 35) the Court ENTERS
20 the following protective order:

21 1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

22 Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or
23 private information for which special protection may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties
24 hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The
25 parties acknowledge that this agreement is consistent with Local Civil Rule 26(c). It does not
26 confer blanket protection on all disclosures or responses to discovery, the protection it affords
from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled
to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles, and it does not presumptively
entitle parties to file confidential information under seal.

1 2. “CONFIDENTIAL” MATERIAL

2 “Confidential” material shall include the following documents and tangible things
3 produced or otherwise exchanged: financial information, business plans, business expansion
4 plans, intellectual property categories, such as new inventions, technologies and improved
5 processes, but also materials such as customer or patient lists and contacts, marketing
6 plans/tactics, recruiting/hiring, pricing/discount information, salary structure, details of its
7 computer system, lease agreements, and vendor contracts.

8 There may be other categories of documents, and this list may be expanded or narrowed
9 as discovery progresses.

10 3. SCOPE

11 The protections conferred by this agreement cover not only designated confidential
12 material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from confidential
13 material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of confidential material; and (3)
14 any testimony, conversations, or presentations by parties or their counsel that might reveal
15 confidential material.

16 However, the protections conferred by this agreement do not cover information that is in
17 the public domain or becomes part of the public domain through trial or otherwise. The party
18 designating material as confidential must perform a good-faith search to determine whether the
19 material it seeks to designate as confidential has been previously produced or otherwise become
20 part of the public domain.

21 4. ACCESS TO AND USE OF CONFIDENTIAL MATERIAL

22 4.1 Basic Principles. A receiving party may use confidential material that is disclosed
23 or produced by another party or by a non-party in connection with this case only for prosecuting,
24 defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Confidential material may be disclosed only to
25 the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this agreement. Confidential

1 material must be stored and maintained by a receiving party at a location and in a secure manner
2 that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this agreement.

3 4.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless otherwise
4 ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the designating party, a receiving party may
5 disclose any confidential material only to:

6 (a) the receiving party’s counsel of record in this action, as well as employees
7 of counsel to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this litigation;

8 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including in-house counsel) of the
9 receiving party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation, unless the parties
10 agree that a particular document or material produced is for Attorney’s Eyes Only and is so
11 designated;

12 (c) experts and consultants to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for
13 this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit
14 A);

15 (d) the Court, court personnel, and court reporters and their staff;

16 (e) copy or imaging services retained by counsel to assist in the duplication of
17 confidential material, provided that counsel for the party retaining the copy or imaging service
18 instructs the service not to disclose any confidential material to third parties and to immediately
19 return all originals and copies of any confidential material;

20 (f) during their depositions or court proceedings, witnesses in the action to
21 whom disclosure is reasonably necessary and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and
22 Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the designating party or
23 ordered by the Court provided, however, that a party may use confidential material at a
24 deposition or court proceeding of a deponent or witness who has not already signed the
25 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), in which case, the party’s
26 obligation shall be to ask that the deponent or witness sign the certification, but the party’s right

to proceed with the deposition or court proceeding shall not depend on the deponent's or witness's willingness to do so. In the event a deponent or witness being shown confidential material refuses to sign the certification, the deponent or witness shall not be permitted to retain, reproduce, or copy all or any part of the confidential material. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal confidential material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this agreement;

(g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

4.3 Filing Confidential Material. Before filing confidential material or discussing or referencing such material in court filings, the filing party shall confer with the designating party, in accordance with Local Civil Rule 5(g)(3)(A), to determine whether the designating party will remove the confidential designation, whether the document can be redacted, or whether a motion to seal or stipulation and proposed order is warranted. During the meet and confer process, the designating party must identify the basis for sealing the specific confidential information at issue, and the filing party shall include this basis in its motion to seal, along with any objection to sealing the information at issue. Local Civil Rule 5(g) sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal. A party who seeks to maintain the confidentiality of its information must satisfy the requirements of Local Civil Rule 5(g)(3)(B), even if it is not the party filing the motion to seal. Failure to satisfy this requirement will result in the motion to seal being denied, in accordance with the strong presumption of public access to the Court's files.

5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each party or non-party that designates information or items for protection under this agreement must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The designating party must designate for protection only those parts of material,

1 documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify, so that other portions of the
2 material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not
3 swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this agreement.

4 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are
5 shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (*e.g.*, to
6 unnecessarily encumber or delay the case development process or to impose unnecessary
7 expenses and burdens on other parties) expose the designating party to sanctions.

8 If it comes to a designating party's attention that information or items that it designated
9 for protection do not qualify for protection, the designating party must promptly notify all other
10 parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

11 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in this
12 agreement (*see, e.g.*, second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or
13 ordered, disclosure or discovery material that qualifies for protection under this agreement must
14 be clearly so designated before or when the material is disclosed or produced.

15 (a) Information in documentary form: (*e.g.*, paper or electronic documents
16 and deposition exhibits, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial
17 proceedings), the designating party must affix the word "CONFIDENTIAL" to each page that
18 contains confidential material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for
19 protection, the producing party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (*e.g.*, by
20 making appropriate markings in the margins).

21 (b) Testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial proceedings: the parties
22 and any participating non-parties must identify on the record, during the deposition or other
23 pretrial proceeding, all protected testimony, without prejudice to their right to so designate other
24 testimony after reviewing the transcript. Any party or non-party may, within fifteen days after
25 receiving the transcript of the deposition or other pretrial proceeding, designate portions of the
26

1 transcript, or exhibits thereto, as confidential. If a party or non-party desires to protect
2 confidential information at trial, the issue should be addressed during the pre-trial conference.

3 (c) Other tangible items: the producing party must affix in a prominent place
4 on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the word
5 "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of the information or item warrant protection,
6 the producing party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

7 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to
8 designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the designating party's
9 right to secure protection under this agreement for such material. Upon timely correction of a
10 designation, the receiving party must make reasonable efforts to ensure that the material is
11 treated in accordance with the provisions of this agreement.

12 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

13 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any party or non-party may challenge a designation of
14 confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a designating party's confidentiality
15 designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic
16 burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a party does not waive its right to
17 challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the
18 original designation is disclosed.

19 6.2 Meet and Confer. The parties must make every attempt to resolve any dispute
20 regarding confidential designations without court involvement. Any motion regarding
21 confidential designations or for a protective order must include a certification, in the motion or in
22 a declaration or affidavit, that the movant has engaged in a good-faith meet and confer
23 conference with other affected parties in an effort to resolve the dispute without court action. The
24 certification must list the date, manner, and participants to the conference. A good-faith effort to
25 confer requires a face-to-face meeting or a telephone conference.

26 //

1 6.3 Judicial Intervention. If the parties cannot resolve a challenge without court
2 intervention, either party may file a motion with the Court for relief to remove or retain
3 confidentiality under Local Civil Rule 7 (and in compliance with Local Civil Rule 5(g), if
4 applicable). The burden of persuasion in any such motion shall be on the designating party.
5 Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (*e.g.*, to harass or impose
6 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the challenging party to
7 sanctions. All parties shall continue to maintain the material in question as confidential until the
8 Court rules on the challenge.

9 7. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER
10 LITIGATION

11 If a party is served with a subpoena or a Court order issued in other litigation that
12 compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL,”
13 that party must:

14 (a) promptly notify the designating party in writing and include a copy of the
15 subpoena or court order;

16 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to
17 issue in the other litigation that some or all the material covered by the subpoena or order is
18 subject to this agreement. Such notification shall include a copy of this agreement; and

19 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued
20 by the designating party whose confidential material may be affected.

21 8. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

22 If a receiving party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed confidential
23 material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this agreement, the receiving
24 party must immediately (a) notify in writing the designating party of the unauthorized
25 disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the protected material,
26 (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of

1 this agreement, and (d) request that such person or persons execute the "Acknowledgment and
2 Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A).

3 **9. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED**
4 **MATERIAL**

5 When a producing party gives notice to receiving parties that certain inadvertently
6 produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the
7 receiving parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This
8 provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery
9 order or agreement that provides for production without prior privilege review. The parties
10 agree to the entry of a non-waiver order under Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) as set forth
11 herein.

12 **10. NON-TERMINATION AND RETURN OF DOCUMENTS**

13 Within 60 days after the termination of this action, including all appeals, each receiving
14 party must return all confidential material to the producing party, including all copies, extracts,
15 and summaries thereof. Alternatively, the parties may agree upon appropriate methods of
16 destruction.

17 Notwithstanding this provision, counsel are entitled to retain one archival copy of all
18 documents filed with the court, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, correspondence,
19 deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert
20 work product, even if such materials contain confidential material.

21 The confidentiality obligations imposed by this agreement shall remain in effect until a
22 designating party agrees otherwise in writing or a court orders otherwise.

23 //

24 //

25 //

26 //

1 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

2 DATED: February 25, 2019

By: / William C. Smart

3 William C. Smart, WSBA #8192

4 Isaac Ruiz, WSBA #35237

Attorneys for Plaintiff

5 DATED: February 25, 2019

By: s/ William C. Smart with Email

6 Authority from Matthew S. Adams

7 Matthew S. Adams, WSBA #18820

8 Miles J.M. Stewart, WSBA #46067

Attorneys for Defendant

9 PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.

10 IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d), the
11 production of any documents in this proceeding shall not, for the purposes of this proceeding or
12 any other federal or state proceeding, constitute a waiver by the producing party of any privilege
13 applicable to those documents, including the attorney-client privilege, attorney work-product
14 protection, or any other privilege or protection recognized by law.

15 DATED this 28th day of February 2019.



16
17 John C. Coughenour
18
19 UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE
20
21
22
23
24
25
26

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [print or type full name], of _____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Western District of Washington on _____ in the case of *Eye Associates Northwest, P.C., v. Sentinel Insurance Company, part of the Hartford Fire & Casualty Group*, Case No. C18-1312-JCC. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the Western District of Washington for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

Date:

City and State where sworn and signed:

Printed name:

Signature: